

Honors Current Controversies in Public Policy
PUP 3002, Sect. 8671

Department of Political Science
University of Florida
Spring 2006

Professor: Michael T. Heaney
Office: Anderson 206
Office Hours: Tuesday 1-3pm; Wednesday 3-5pm; Thursday 2-4pm.
Phone: 352-392-0262, ext. 236; FAX: 352-392-8127
E-mail: mtheaney @ ufl.edu
Web: <http://plaza.ufl.edu/mtheaney/>
Times: Tuesdays 3:00 pm-4:55pm (period 8)
Thursdays 4:05pm-4:55pm (periods 8 and 9)
Location: Anderson 019

COURSE DESCRIPTION

What makes a public policy controversial? Citizens accept many public policies without question. Few people question the authority of a state to issue driver's licenses and to require people to carry them in order to operate automobiles. Yet other policies explode in controversy. Marriage laws have periodically sparked disputes over the age, race, and sex of who is allowed to marry. Controversies come and go. Policies over trades and tariffs once caused bitter divisions among the sections of the United States, but are now relatively minor sources of disagreement. Disputes over the treatment of African slaves and their descendants have lingered throughout the history of the republic.

This course explores the processes that generate controversy in public policy. We consider how elected leaders, bureaucrats, the media, interest groups, and policy experts think about, mold, and attempt to manipulate policy controversies. We give close attention to the framing and presentation of arguments. We focus on debates over eight currently controversial issues: same-sex marriage, stem cell research, school choice, Social Security, immigration, the Patriot Act, affirmative action, and welfare reform. We situate these current controversies within the context of the enduring tensions from which they emerge, such as freedom versus security and centralization versus decentralization. Students learn to strategize and frame issues, with an eye toward becoming engaged participants in policy debates.

REQUIREMENTS

1. *Class Attendance and Participation* (20% of grade). Students are expected to attend class regularly and to contribute constructively to class discussions and small-group exercises. "Constructive" contribution requires completing assigned

- readings in advance and being respectful of one's peers. Role will be taken to verify attendance.
2. *Three Short Essays* (15% of grade each) – Due in class on February 23, March 23, and April 25. These essays will be written in response to a specific question posed by the professor and are limited to 1,000 words in length. HARD PAPER COPY submission required. (Do not e-mail me your paper.)
 3. *Final Paper* (35% of grade) – Due on Thursday, May 4 at 3pm. Students will write a research paper of 5000-6000 words in length. The paper should analyze the strategy of a government agency, elected politician, interest group, or think tank in dealing with one of the policy issues addressed in this class.

GRADES

“Quality” grades, rather than “numerical” grades, will be assigned to all work completed in this class. Quality grades are A+,A,B+,B,C+,C,D+,D, and E. The final grade will be based on a weighed average of the grades earned on all required work.

REQUIRED READINGS

The following books are on reserve at the Marston Science Library and have been ordered for purchase through the university's on-line textbook adoption system:

- John Kingdon. 2003. *Agendas, Alternatives, and Public Policies*, 2nd Edition. New York: Addison-Wesley.
- Giandomenico Majone. 1989. *Evidence, Argument, and Persuasion in the Policy Process*. New Haven: Yale University Press.

A required course packet is available for purchase at Custom Copy, 309 NW 13th Street.

ACADEMIC HONESTY

All students are required to abide by the Academic Honesty Guidelines of the University of Florida. Among other things, this means: (1) Students must submit only their own, original work in fulfillment of course requirements; (2) Examinations are to be taken without the aid of notes, books, or other people; (3) Students must provide truthful representations to the professor on issues such as reasons for missing class. Violating this policy may cause a student to suffer severe grade penalties, failure of the class, academic probation, or expulsion from the university.

MISCELLANEOUS

- The use of wireless communication devices (such as cell phones or pagers) during class is prohibited. Please turn them off. (Do not put your cell phone on “vibrate.”) The professor reserves the right to confiscate devices operating in violation of this policy.
- Students requiring any special accommodation for this course are responsible for making an appointment to see the professor at the beginning of the semester. Every effort will be made to meet your needs in accordance with University guidelines.
- The lectures and handouts of this course are the intellectual property of the professor. You do not have the right to sell your notes or recordings from this class for profit without the express written consent of the professor. No recording devices are permitted in class without the consent of the professor.

COURSE OUTLINE

PART I. INTRODUCTION TO THE COURSE

- Charles Perrow. 2005. “Using Organizations: The Case of FEMA.” *Understanding Katrina: Perspectives from the Social Sciences*. Social Science Research Council. <http://understandingkatrina.ssrc.org>.
- Paul Frymer, Dara Z. Strolovitch, and Dorian T. Warren. 2005. “Katrina’s Political Roots and Divisions: Race, Class, and Federalism in American Politics.” *Understanding Katrina: Perspectives from the Social Sciences*. Social Science Research Council. <http://understandingkatrina.ssrc.org>.
- Louise K. Comfort. 2005. “Fragility in Disaster Response: Hurricane Katrina, 29 August 2005.” *The Forum*, Vol. 3, No. 3, Article 1.
- Patrick S. Roberts. 2005. “What Katrina Means for Emergency Management.” *The Forum*, Vol. 3, No. 3, Article 2.

Tuesday, January 10: Explanation of course objectives and procedures

Thursday, January 12: Responding to Hurricane Katrina

PART II. THEORETICAL FOUNDATIONS

1. AGENDA SETTING

- John Kingdon. 1995. *Agendas, Alternatives, and Public Policies*, 2nd Edition. New York: Addison-Wesley.

Tuesday, January 17: Kingdon, Chapters 1-4.

Thursday, January 19: Kingdon, Chapters 5-7.

Tuesday, January 24: Kingdon, Chapters 8-10.

2. MAKING POLICY ARGUMENTS

- Giandomenico Majone. 1989. *Evidence, Argument, and Persuasion in the Policy Process*. New Haven: Yale University Press.

Thursday, January 26: Majone, Chapters 1-4.

Tuesday, January 31: Majone, Chapters 5-8.

3. FRAMING DISCOURSE

- William H. Riker. 1986. *The Art of Political Manipulation*. New Haven: Yale University Press. Chapter 10.
- William A. Gamson. 1988. "Political Discourse and Collective Action." *International Social Movement Research*, Vol. 1: 219-244.
- Deborah A. Stone. 1988. *Policy Paradox and Political Reason*. New York: HarperCollins. Chapters 6-8.

Thursday, February 2: Riker

Tuesday, February 7: Gamson

Thursday, February 9: Stone.

4. COLLECTIVE ACTION

- Russell Hardin. 1982. *Collective Action*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press. Chapters 2-4.

Tuesday, February 14: Hardin, Chapter 2.

Thursday, February 16: Hardin, Chapters 3-4.

PART III. ENDURING CONTROVERSIES IN CURRENT CONTEXTS

1. SAME-SEX MARRIAGE: Collective Values vs. Individual Autonomy

- David Moats. 2003. "Civil Unions in Vermont: Public Reason Improvised." *Perspectives on Politics*, Vol. 1, No. 1 (March): 131-135.
- Andrew J. Cherlin. 2003. "Should the Government Promote Marriage?" *Contexts* (Fall): 22-29.
- Rick Santorum. 2003. "The Necessity of Marriage." *Heritage Lectures*, No. 804 (September 25): 1-3.
- Matthew Spalding. 2003. *In Defense of Marriage*. WebMemo #373. Washington, DC: Heritage Foundation.
- Jennifer Marshall. 2004. *Marriage: What Social Science Says and Doesn't Say*. WebMemo #503. Washington, DC: Heritage Foundation.
- Matthew Spalding. 2004. *Will DOMA Protect Marriage?* WebMemo #532. Washington, DC: Heritage Foundation.
- Susan M. Shell. 2004. "The Liberal Case Against Gay Marriage." *Public Interest* (Summer): 3-16.
- Gary M. Segura (ed.). 2005. "A Symposium on the Politics of Same-Sex Marriage." *PS: Political Science and Politics*, Vol. 38, No. 2 (April): 189-240.

Tuesday, February 21: Same-Sex Marriage Readings.

Thursday, February 23: Same-Sex Marriage Readings. **FIRST SHORT ESSAY DUE**

2. STEM CELL RESEARCH: Science vs. Ethics

- National Academies. 2002. *The Promise of Stem Cells: From Research to Medical Therapies*. Washington, DC: National Academies.
- Soren Holm. 2002. "Going to the Roots of the Stem Cell Controversy." *Bioethics*, Vol. 16, No. 6: 493-507.
- Thomas Heinemann and Ludger Honnefelder. 2002. "Principles of Ethical Decision Making Regarding Embryonic Stem Cell Research in Germany." *Bioethics*, Vol. 16, No. 6: 530-543.
- Executive Office of the President. 2005. *Statement of Administration Policy, H.R. 810 – Stem Cell Research Enhancement Act of 2005*. Washington, DC: Office of Management and Budget.
- National Right to Life Committee. 2005. *Human Cloning Legislation in Congress: Misconceptions and Realities*. Washington, DC: NRLC.
- Coalition for the Advancement of Medical Research. 2005. *Don't Deny Hope: Saving and Improving Lives*. Washington, DC: CAMR.
- Alexander Meissner and Rudolf Jaenisch. 2005. "Generation of nuclear transfer-derived pluripotent ES cells from closed Cdx2-deficient blastocysts." *Nature*. October 16.
- Nicholas Wade. 2005. "Stem Cell Test Tried on Mice Saves Embryo." *New York Times*. October 17.

Tuesday, February 28: Stem Cell Readings

Thursday, March 2: Stem Cell Readings

3. SCHOOL CHOICE: Markets vs. Hierarchy

- Jennifer Hochschild. 2001. "Public Schools and the American Dream." *Dissent* (Fall): 35-42.
- Helen F. Ladd. 2002. "School Vouchers: A Critical View." *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, Vol. 16, No. 4 (Fall): 3-24.
- Derek Neal. 2002. "How Vouchers Could Change the Market for Education." *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, Vol. 16, No. 4 (Fall): 25-44.

- Joseph P. Viteritti. 2005. "School Choice: How an Abstract Idea Became a Political Reality." *Brookings Papers on Education Policy*: 138-173.
- Krista Kafer. 2005. "Choices in Education: 2005 Progress Report." *Backgrounder, Published by the Heritage Foundation*, No. 1848 (April 25): 1-10.
- Kevin Smith. 2005. "Data Don't Matter? Academic Research and School Choice." *Perspectives on Politics*, Vol. 3, No. 2 (June): 285-299.

Tuesday, March 7: School Choice Readings

Thursday, March 9: School Choice Readings

Tuesday, March 14: **NO CLASS for SPRING BREAK**

Thursday, March 16: **NO CLASS for SPRING BREAK**

4. SOCIAL SECURITY: Incremental vs. Comprehensive Reform

- David Brooks. 2004. "Real Reform for Social Security." *New York Times*. December 11.
- James R. Hines, Jr. and Timothy Taylor. 2005. "Shortfalls in the Long Run: Predictions about the Social Security Trust Fund." *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, Vol. 19, No. 2 (Spring): 3-9.
- Peter A. Diamond and Peter R. Orszag. 2005. "Saving Social Security." *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, Vol. 19, No. 2 (Spring): 11-32.
- Martin Feldstein. 2005. "Structural Reform of Social Security." *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, Vol. 19, No. 2 (Spring): 33-55.
- Mark Levinson. 2005. "Worse Than You Thought: Bush's Budget and the Gutting of Social Security." *Dissent* (Spring): 30-34.

Tuesday, March 21: Social Security Readings

Thursday, March 23: Social Security Readings. **SECOND SHORT ESSAY DUE**

5. IMMIGRATION: Openness vs. Isolation

- Ruth Ellen Wasem and Geoffrey K. Collver. 2001. *RL30852: Immigration of Agricultural Guest Workers: Policy, Trends, and Legislation*. Washington, DC: Congressional Research Service.

- Ronald Hayduk. 2004. "Democracy for All: Restoring Immigrant Voting Rights in the US." *New Political Science*, Vol. 26, No. 4 (December): 499-523.
- Lynn H. Fujiwara. 2005. "Immigrant Rights Are Human Rights: The Reframing of Immigrant Entitlement and Welfare." *Social Problems*, Vol. 52, No. 1: 79-101.
- Yasmeen Abu-Laban and Judith A. Garber. 2005. "The Construction of the Geography of Immigration as a Policy Problem: The United States and Canada Compared." *Urban Affairs Review*, Vol. 40, No. 4 (March): 520-561.
- Robert A. Levine. 2005. "Assimilation, Past, and Present." *Public Interest* (Spring): 93-108.

Tuesday, March 28: Immigration Readings

Thursday, March 30: Immigration Readings

6. THE PATRIOT ACT AND TERRORISM: Security vs. Freedom

- Timothy Lynch. 2002. "Breaking the Vicious Cycle: Preserving Our Liberties While Fighting Terrorism." *Policy Analysis*, No. 443 (June 26): 1-21.
- Jean Bethke Elshtain. 2003. "Intellectual Dissent and the War on Terror." *Public Interest* (Spring): 86-95.
- John Yoo and Eric Posner. 2003. *The Patriot Act Under Fire*. Washington, DC: American Enterprise Institute.
- Stuart Taylor, Jr. 2004. "Rights, Liberties, and Security: Recalibrating the Balance After September 11." *Brookings Review* (Winter): 25-31.
- Eli Lehrer. 2004. "The Homeland Security Bureaucracy." *Public Interest* (Summer): 71-85.
- James Jay Carafano and Paul Rosenzweig. 2005. *Law Strikes Right Balance*. Washington, DC: Heritage Foundation.
- Staff. 2005. "Secret Evidence in the War on Terror." *Harvard Law Review*, Vol. 118, No. 6 (April): 1962-1984.

Tuesday, April 4: Patriot Act Readings

Thursday, April 6: Patriot Act Readings

7. AFFIRMATIVE ACTION: Rectifying Inequality vs. Accepting Inequality

- Ruth Bader Ginsburg. 2000. "Affirmative Action as an International Human Rights Dialogue." *Brookings Review* (Winter): 2-3.
- Peter H. Schuck. 2002. "Affirmative Action: Don't Mend It or End It – Bend It." *Brookings Review* (Winter): 24-27.
- Jennifer Lee and Frank D. Bean. 2003. "Beyond Black and White: Remaking Race in America." *Contexts* (Summer): 26-33.
- Richard H. Sander. 2004. "A Systemic Analysis of Affirmative Action in American Law Schools." *Stanford Law Review*, Vol. 57 (November): 367-483.

Tuesday, April 11: Affirmative Action Readings

Thursday, April 13: Affirmative Action Readings

8. WELFARE REFORM: Centralization vs. Decentralization

- Tommy G. Thompson. 2001. "Welfare Reform's Next Step." *Brookings Review* (Summer): 2-3.
- Tom Downey. 2001. "Republicans With Hearts Give Democrats Hope." *Brookings Review* (Summer): 8-10.
- Wendell Primus. 2001. "What Next for Welfare Reform?" *Brookings Review* (Summer): 17-19.
- Mark Greenberg. 2001. "Welfare Reform and Devolution: Looking Back and Forward." *Brookings Review* (Summer): 20-24.
- Richard P. Nathan and Thomas L. Gais. 2001. "Federal and State Roles in Welfare: Is Devolution Working?" *Brookings Review* (Summer): 25-29.
- Bruce Katz and Katherine Allen. 2001. "Cities Matter: Shifting the Focus of Welfare Reform." *Brookings Review* (Summer): 30-33.
- Gordon Berlin. 2001. "The 30-Year Tug of War: Can Reform Resolve Welfare Policy's Thorniest Conundrum?" *Brookings Review* (Summer): 35-38.
- Sandra Hofferth. 2002. "Did Welfare Reform Work? Implications for 2002 and Beyond." *Contexts* (Spring): 45-51.

- Robert E. Rector, Melissa G. Pardue, and Lauren R. Noyes. “‘Marriage Plus’: Sabotaging the President’s Effort’s to Promote Healthy Marriage.” *Backgrounder, Published by the Heritage Foundation*, No. 1677 (August 22): 1-11.
- Evelyn Z. Brodtkin. 2003. “Requiem for Welfare.” *Dissent* (Winter): 29-36.
- Lawrence M. Mead. 2004. “The Culture of Welfare Reform.” *Public Interest* (Winter): 99-110.
- Sanford F. Schram. 2005. “Contextualizing Racial Disparities in American Welfare Reform: Toward a New Poverty Research Agenda.” *Perspectives on Politics*, Vol. 3, No. 2 (June): 253-268.

Tuesday, April 18: Welfare readings

Thursday, April 20: **CLASS CANCELLED** because of the Annual Meeting of the Midwest Political Science Association

Tuesday, April 25: Welfare readings. **THIRD SHORT ESSAY DUE.**

Thursday, April 27: Reading day – **NO CLASS.**

Thursday, May 4: **FINAL PAPER** due at 3pm. (This is the time of the scheduled final exam for exam Group 4D)