

Memorandum

To: The Cincinnati Enquirer
CC: Kristen DelGuzzi
From: Ashley N. Ear;
Date: September 16, 2007
Re: Data Analysis of Hamilton County Judges

Probabilities used to assist with Ranking of Hamilton County Judges

After the current statistics were gathered to produce data analysis regarding Hamilton County Judges, we can come to a conclusion and rank judges appropriately by their probability to be appealed, reversed and a combination of the both.

With the provided data analysis, I have included statistics to all probabilities including: total cases disposed, appealed cases, reversed cases, probability of appeal, rank by probability of appeal, probability of reversal, rank by probability of reversal, conditional probability of reversal given appeal, rank by conditional probability of reversal given appeal and overall sum of ranks. The judges that rank the highest (i.e. 1st, 2nd, 3rd) have the lowest probability to have appealed cases, reversed cases and lowest conditional probability of reversed cases given appeal. In my opinion, by ranking the judges as such, we can see how often their ruling is upheld, which is ultimately desirable when concerning the credibility of a judge.

I have provided rankings for all three different courts including: Common Pleas Court, Domestic Relations Court and Municipal Court. These overall rankings are gathered by summing up all of the rankings by the three probability variables. I have also provided data analysis which interprets who is the most credible judge overall out of the three courts.

Judges with Lowest Probability of Appeals:

Court	Judge	Probability of Appeal
Common Pleas	Ralph Winkler	0.02849
Domestic Relations	Ronald Panioto	0.00247
Municipal	Karla Grady	0.00114

Judges with Lowest Probability of Reversal:

Court	Judge	Probability of Reversal
Common Pleas	Ralph Winkler	0.00194
Domestic Relations	Ronald Panioto	0.00023
Municipal	Karla Grady & Deidra Hair	0.00000

Judges with Lowest Probability of Reversal given that they have had an Appeal:

Court	Judge	Probability of Reversal
Common Pleas	Thomas Nurre	0.04959
Domestic Relations	Ronald Panioto	0.09375
Municipal	Karla Grady & Deidra Hair	0.00000

- ∞ Taking into consideration the sum of all rankings of all three probabilities, we can come up with a general ranking of the top Judges from each court. This is a representation of ranking the *overall* effectiveness of the judges. This is done by taking a sum of all of the three ranking variables and whoever has the lowest sum represents the judge with the best rankings. The following conclusion was made: As shown by my data analysis below, Judge Ralph Winkler has the best ranking in Common Pleas Court, Ronald Panioto has the best ranking in Domestic Relations Court and Karla Grady has the best ranking in Municipal Court.

The Data Analysis is included in the following pages to allow for room to include all the data.

Data Analysis Regarding Common Pleas Court:

Common Pleas Court										
Judge	Total Cases Disposed	Appealed Cases	Reversed Cases	Probability of Appeal	Rank	Probability of Reversal	Rank	Conditional Probability of Reversal Given Appeal	Rank	Sum of Ranks
Fred Cartolano	3037	137	12	0.04511	14	0.00395	6	0.08759	5	25
Thomas Crush	3372	119	10	0.03529	4	0.00297	4	0.08403	4	12
Patrick Dinkelacker	1258	44	8	0.03498	3	0.00636	12	0.18182	14	29
Timothy Hogan	1954	60	7	0.03071	2	0.00358	5	0.11667	9	16
Robert Kraft	3138	127	7	0.04047	10	0.00223	3	0.05512	2	15
William Mathews	2264	91	18	0.04019	7	0.00795	15	0.19780	16	38
William Morrissey	3032	121	22	0.03991	6	0.00726	14	0.18182	15	35
Norbert Nadel	2959	131	20	0.04427	13	0.00676	13	0.15267	12	38
Arthur Ney Jr.	3219	125	14	0.03883	5	0.00435	9	0.11200	8	22
Richard Niehaus	3353	137	16	0.04086	11	0.00477	10	0.11679	10	31
Thomas Nurre	3000	121	6	0.04033	8	0.00200	2	0.04959	1	11
John O'Connor	2969	129	12	0.04345	12	0.00404	7	0.09302	6	25
Robert Ruehlman	3205	145	18	0.04524	15	0.00562	11	0.12414	11	37
J. Howard Sundermann Jr.	955	60	10	0.06283	16	0.01047	16	0.16667	13	45
Ann Marie Tracey	3141	127	13	0.04043	9	0.00414	8	0.10236	7	24
Ralph Winkler	3089	88	6	0.02849	1	0.00194	1	0.06818	3	5
Total	43945	1762	199	0.65139		0.07839		1.80268		

Data Analysis Regarding Municipal Court:

Municipal Court											
Judge	Total Cases Disposed	Appealed Cases	Reversed Cases	Probability of Appeal	Rank	Probability of Reversal	Rank	Conditional Probability of Reversal Given Appeal	Rank	Sum of Ranks	
Mike Allen	6149	43	4	0.00699	20	0.00065	6	0.09302	3	29	
Nadine Allen	7812	34	6	0.00435	9	0.00077	10	0.17647	9	28	
Timothy Black	7954	41	6	0.00515	12	0.00075	9	0.14634	5	26	
David Davis	7736	43	5	0.00556	15	0.00065	5	0.11628	4	24	
Leslie Isaiah Gaines	5282	35	13	0.00663	19	0.00246	19	0.37143	17	55	
Karla Grady	5253	6	0	0.00114	1	0.00000	1	0.00000	1	3	
Deidra Hair	2532	5	0	0.00197	3	0.00000	1	0.00000	1	5	
Dennis Helmick	7900	29	5	0.00367	6	0.00063	4	0.17241	8	18	
Timothy Hogan	2308	13	2	0.00563	17	0.00087	12	0.15385	6	35	
James Patrick Kenney	2798	6	1	0.00214	4	0.00036	3	0.16667	7	14	
Joseph Luebbers	4698	25	8	0.00532	14	0.00170	17	0.32000	15	46	
William Mallory	8277	38	9	0.00459	11	0.00109	13	0.23684	13	37	
Melba Marsh	8219	34	7	0.00414	8	0.00085	11	0.20588	12	31	
Beth Mattingly	2971	13	1	0.00438	10	0.00034	2	0.07692	2	14	
Albert Mestemaker	4975	28	9	0.00563	16	0.00181	18	0.32143	10	44	
Mark Painter	2239	7	3	0.00313	5	0.00134	15	0.42857	18	38	
Jack Rosen	7790	41	13	0.00526	13	0.00167	16	0.31707	14	43	
Mark Schweikert	5403	33	6	0.00611	18	0.00111	14	0.18182	10	42	
David Stockdale	5371	22	4	0.00410	7	0.00074	8	0.18182	11	26	
John A. West	2797	4	2	0.00143	2	0.00072	7	0.50000	19	28	
Total	108464	500	104	0.08733		0.01850		4.16683			

Data Analysis Regarding Domestic Relations Court:

Domestic Relations Court										
Judge	Total Cases Disposed	Appealed Cases	Reversed Cases	Probability of Appeal	Rank	Probability of Reversal	Rank	Conditional Probability of Reversal Given Appeal	Rank	Sum of Ranks
Penelope Cunningham	2729	7	1	0.00257	2	0.00037	2	0.14286	2	6
Patrick Dinkelacker	6001	19	4	0.00317	3	0.00067	3	0.21053	4	10
Deborah Gaines	8799	48	9	0.00546	4	0.00102	4	0.18750	3	11
Ronald Panioto	12970	32	3	0.00247	1	0.00023	1	0.09375	1	3
Total	30499	106	17	0.01365		0.00229		0.63463		